By Susan J. Blumenthal, M.D., Jessica B. Rubin, Michelle E. Treseler, Jefferson Lin, and David Mattos*

Hillary Clinton	John Edwards	Barack Obama

Stated Goals for Coverage	 Provide affordable, quality health coverage for all Americans¹¹ Decrease costs, promote wellness and prevent illness 	>	Provide universal health care that cuts costs and provides better care ²	>	Provide affordable, comprehensive, and portable health insurance for every American ⁷
Mandatory Insurance Requirement	No information found	•	All residents required to have insurance coverage except in cases of extreme financial hardship or religious beliefs ²	AAA	Believes that if health care becomes affordable, most Americans will buy it ³ Mandatory health insurance coverage for children only ³ Young people up to age 25 may continue coverage through parents' plans ⁷
Costs of Plan	No information found		\$90 billion to \$120 billion ⁴		\$50 billion to \$65 billion ⁵
How costs are covered	 7 step strategy for reducing health care costs includes: national prevention initiative, "paperless" health information technology system, transformation of care for chronically ill, ending insurance discrimination, establishing an independent "Best Practices" Institute, smart purchasing initiatives, and malpractice reforms¹¹ Cost savings used to help finance coverage for uninsured⁶ 	A A	Proposes a new tax credit to subsidize insurance purchased through health markets that will be available on a sliding scale for middle and lower income families and refundable for families without income tax liability ² Repeal Bush's tax cuts for people with annual incomes greater than \$200,000 ²	A	Four steps to modernize U.S. health care system to contain health care costs, including: offering Federal reinsurance to some employers for unexpected or catastrophic illnesses, ensuring that patients receive quality care, adopting health information technology, and increasing market competition ⁷ Allow tax cuts on dividends and capital gains and for individuals with annual incomes of more than

	SIDE-DI-SIDE COMITARISONS OF L		
Estimated savings	 At least \$120 billion/year nationally^{6,11} > \$2,200/year/family^{6,11} > \$25 billion in savings for businesses^{6,11} > \$77 billion from use of health IT¹¹ 	 100,000 to 150,000 lives/year² \$100 billion to \$150 billion/year² \$2,000 to \$2,500/year/family¹⁰ Estimated savings of up to \$162 billion/year from use of health IT¹⁰ 	 \$250,000 to expire in 2010⁵ May increase estate taxes on inheritances valued at more than \$7 million⁵ Partnerships among Federal and state governments, employers, providers, and individuals⁷ Provide subsidies for families that don't qualify for Medicaid or SCHIP⁷ Up to \$2,500/year/family⁷ Up to \$200 billion/year nationally⁷ Savings achieved through investments in health IT, prevention, reducing uncompensated care, and increasing insurance industry competition⁷ Estimated savings of up to \$77 billion/year from use of health IT⁷
Implementation Timeline	No information found	 Insure all Americans by 2012² 	Sign universal health care plan into law by end of first term in office (2012) ⁷
Coverage for Children	No information found	 Commit necessary Federal resources to allow states to expand SCHIP to all children and their parents below 250% of poverty line² 	 All children required to have coverage⁷ Expand eligibility for SCHIP⁷ Young people up to age 25 can continue coverage through parents' plans⁷
Medicaid Expansion	No information found	 Commit necessary Federal resources to cover all adults under the poverty line² 	 Expand eligibility for Medicaid⁷
New Federal/Public Plans	No information found	Proposes public insurance plan modeled after Medicare but separate and apart from it ²	 Establish new national health plan Will provide affordable, portable health coverage that is similar to plan available to Federal employees⁷ Open to individuals without access to group coverage, to

			those who are self-employed, and to small businesses that
			want to offer insurance to
			their employees ⁷
			• Simple enrollment ⁷
			 Uninsured can pick from
			among a group of plans ⁷
			 States can continue to experiment
			with their plans, provided they
			meet minimum standards of
			national plan ⁷
			Provide income-related Federal
			subsidies for those who do not
			qualify for Medicaid or SCHIP to
			buy into the new public plan or
			purchase private insurance ⁷
			 Offer Federal reimbursement to
			employers for unexpected or
			catastrophic illnesses if they
			guarantee to use savings to reduce
			cost of worker's premium ⁷
Insurance Pools	 Establishes large insurance pools 	State and regional Health Markets	 Establish National Health
	that lower administrative costs by	(non-profit purchasing pools) that	Insurance Exchange for
	spreading risk and preventing	offer choice of competing	consumers to either enroll in new
	companies from shifting costs as	insurance plans to individuals and $\frac{1}{2}$	public plan or shop among private
	easily ⁶	employers ²	plans: creates rules and standards
		Choice between private and public incurrence though the system may	for participating private insurance
		insurance, though the system may evolve to a single-payer approach	plans to ensure coverage that is more affordable and accessible ⁷
		over time if businesses and	All plans offered must be at
		individuals prefer the public plan ²	least as generous as new
		individuals prefer the public plan	public plan ⁷
			 Insurers required to justify above-
			average premium increase to
			National Health Insurance
			Exchange ⁷
			Exchange acts as a "watchdog" by
			evaluating plans and making
			differences between them transparent ⁷

	SIDE-DI-SIDE COMPARISONS OF L		
Employer Mandate	No information found	 Businesses and other employers required to either cover employees or pay a percentage of their payrolls to a fund that would help individuals purchase health insurance¹¹ Can choose to purchase insurance through Health Markets for lower costs and reducing administrative burdens² 	 Employers have to share cost of ensuring workers either by offering insurance or paying a percentage of their payroll toward the costs of the national plan to provide coverage⁷ Smallest businesses are exempt from requirement (exact size not yet reported)⁸
Disease Prevention	 All insurers who are already participating in a Federal health program, like Medicare, Medicaid or FEHP, required to cover prevention as a condition of doing business with the Federal government⁶ Provide financial incentives like reducing co-payments to increase utilization of preventive care¹ Public-private collaborations to ensure that prevention is emphasized in schools, workplaces, supermarkets, and communities through free provision of preventive benefits⁶ Fund and train new health prevention outreach workers who can effectively communicate with the country's diverse populations⁶ 	 Change reimbursement rules to emphasize primary care¹⁰ Health Markets to offer primary and preventive services at little or no cost² Incentives reward individuals who schedule free physicals and enroll in healthy living programs⁹ Redesign Federal insurance programs to include incentives for families to use wellness programs¹⁰ Include health education efforts in government programs¹⁰ Increase public health funding and improve coordination among health departments¹⁰ Promote workplace interventions¹⁰ Support smoking cessation efforts¹⁰ Support community efforts to improve health (safe streets, walking and biking trails, safe and well-equipped parks, physical education programs)¹⁰ Promote diabetes prevention programs in private plans¹⁰ Create a National Taskforce to 	 Promote prevention and strengthen public health to prevent disease⁷ Support school-based screening programs, clinical services, physical education, and health education programs⁷ Expand funding of prevention and public health activities to ensure a strong workforce, including worksite health promotion programs⁷ Require coverage of preventive services in all Federally supported health plans and new public plan including screenings and smoking cessation programs⁷ Increase funding for community based preventive interventions, including: sidewalks, biking paths, walking trails, restricted tobacco and alcohol advertising to children, and wellness and educational campaigns⁷ Foster collaboration between governments at all levels⁷ Optimize organization of the existing 3000 health departments

		 provide school nutrition guidelines that emphasize healthy food options¹⁰ Increase funding for physical education and healthy lifestyle programs¹⁰ Provide tax incentives for businesses that promote healthy living programs¹⁰ Establish nationwide healthy lifestyles campaign to promote individuals' healthy choices¹⁰ in the nation as well as collaboration with private partners⁷
Chronic Disease Management	 Provide chronic care coordination models, including medical "homes", accessible under Federally-funded plans⁶ Ensure higher quality and better coordination of care through incentives for participation in these programs for both patients and physicians¹¹ 	 New payment systems for Medicare to ensure that patients have a medical "home" with a doctor to coordinate their care¹⁰ Require insurers offering health plans through Health Care Markets and other public plans to use disease management programs¹⁰ Invest in programs that encourage doctors to communicate with each other and technologies that allow them to efficiently access patient information¹⁰ Use technology to help Medicare patients manage chronic conditions and offer support such as case managers to ensure patient adherence with treatment plans¹⁰ Provide incentives for private plans to cover disease management¹⁰ Create new national standards for inclusion of preventive and chronic care management services with minimal cost-sharing¹⁰ Fund state efforts to expand home care and reform long term care

system¹⁰ Help finance state-level reforms⁷ Long Term Care \triangleright Pass legislation to provide respite \triangleright No information found services for caregivers of elderly Establish national standards for \geq nursing home care¹⁰ and disabled Americans¹¹ Support innovative alternatives to nursing home care¹⁰ \triangleright Improve quality of care and crack \geq down on elder abuse through expansion of inspections¹⁰ Increase national enforcement against abusive nursing home chains¹⁰ Increase penalties for nursing \geq homes that fail to meet standards for quality care¹⁰ Provide excellence awards and \triangleright grants to nursing homes to help improve quality of care¹⁰ Support respite care and other \geq support services for families, nurses and other aides¹⁰ Improve wages, training and \geq working conditions for long term care aides¹⁰ Establish Internet clearinghouse to \geq provide families with more information about available services¹⁰ Cover agency-employed home \geq health aides under minimum wage and overtime protections¹⁰ Implement initiatives to retain an **Nursing Shortage** No information found \triangleright No information found estimated 50,000 trained nurses who may be leaving the profession and recruit an additional 50,000 young people into the profession¹⁰ Increase funding for nursing schools¹⁰ \geq Foster partnerships between \geq

	SIDE-BY-SIDE COMPARISONS OF L		
		nursing schools and hospitals in	
		order to increase the number of	
		nursing students by 30% over five	
		years ¹⁰	
		Provide tuition assistance for	
		nursing students who agree to	
		work in underserved areas ¹⁰	
		Improve workplace conditions	
		through Federal challenge grants	
		and mentoring programs ¹⁰	
Quality/Evidence-based	Provide incentives to encourage	Devise systems to pay doctors for	> Participating providers in new
Health Care	doctors to keep up with research	results, as opposed to current fee-	public plans, National Health
iitaitii Cart	advances and prescribe most	for-service system ¹⁰	Insurance Exchange, Medicare,
	effective treatments ⁶	 Establish a non-profit or public 	and FEHB will be rewarded for
	 Establish new Independent "Best 	organization, (perhaps within	achieving performance thresholds
	Practices" Institute: partnership	IOM), to research and compile	on physician-validated outcome
	among public and private sectors	best methods of providing health	measures ⁷
	to finance comparative	care ¹⁰	 Require providers and hospitals to
	effectiveness research ⁶	• Will evaluate devices and	
			collect and report data to ensure
	 Utilize best practices: provide 	drugs, compare	standards are being met for
	guidance for professionals on what	effectiveness, and	quality, IT, patient safety, and $\frac{7}{7}$
	drugs, devices, surgeries and	disseminate findings to	administration ⁷
	treatments work best ⁶	health care providers and	 Establish independent Institute to
	Reduce use of inefficient and	patients ¹⁰	guide reviews and research on
	ineffective treatments ⁶	Incentives for the use of evidence-	comparative effectiveness drugs,
		based care and treatments ¹⁰	devices and procedures to improve
		Use new technologies to provide	medical decision-making ⁷
		doctors with easy access to the	Require health plans to disclose
		latest health information ¹⁰	percentage of premiums spent on
		 Partnerships among academic 	direct patient care ⁷
		medical centers, Medicare, and	-
		other Federal agencies to ensure	
		practice of high-quality medicine	
		across the U.S. ¹⁰	
		 Public-private collaborations to 	
		reorganize patient care, improve	
		internal communications, reduce	
		errors through electronic	
		prescribing and establish basic	
I Contraction of the second		quality benchmarks ¹⁰	
		quanty benchinarks	

Transparency/Consumer Friendliness	Develop and institute a standard health form with a common vocabulary that insurance companies must use ⁶	 Institute "Consumer Reports" for health care: universal, easy-to-use report card to help individuals evaluate hospitals' treatment effectiveness —readily available on Internet and in hard copy¹⁰ Require health plans to disclose percentage of premiums spent on patient care and administration¹⁰ Require doctors and hospitals to provide information on several key quality measures¹⁰ 	 Simplify paperwork for providers Require hospitals and providers to collect and publicly report measures of health care costs and quality⁷ Require health plans to disclose percentage of premiums spent on direct patient care⁷
Information Technology (IT)	 Estimated net savings of \$77 billion/year⁶ Require providers who participate in Federal programs to adopt private, secure, and interoperable health information technology⁶ Invest \$3 billion a year in health IT grants to develop a "paperless" health care system⁶ Provide doctors with financial incentives to adopt health IT¹¹ 	 Estimated savings of up to \$162 billion/year¹⁰ Ensure protection of patients' privacy rights² Require physicians who want to participate in Federal insurance programs to use interoperable IT that protects privacy¹⁰ Offer financial incentives to doctors and hospitals if needed to implement¹⁰ Require doctors receiving technology grants to report key quality measures¹⁰ Provide resources to hospitals for medication dispensers that quickly and accurately fill prescriptions¹⁰ Promote patient-doctor communication systems and patient support systems via e- mail¹⁰ Institute computerized physician order entry¹⁰ Develop computerized patient reminder systems¹⁰ Use wireless handheld devices to allow hospital staff to communicate directly to 	 Estimated savings of up to \$77 billion/year⁷ Invest \$10 billion/year over the next five years for health IT system⁷ Adopt standards-based electronic health information systems including electronic health records⁷ Phase in requirements for full implementation of health IT and commit Federal resources for implementation⁷ Ensure that systems are developed in coordination with health providers and institutions, including rural and underserved areas⁷ Ensure protection of patients' privacy⁷

CHART #1: SIDE-BY-SIDE COMPARISONS OF LEADING DEMOCRATIC CANDIDATES' HEALTH PLANS physicians¹⁰

		physicians	
Telemedicine	No information found	 Assist rural hospitals and health centers to purchase and implement telemedicine systems¹⁰ Establish at least 15 Regional Telemedicine Centers across the country and share best practices¹⁰ 	No information found
Health Insurance Regulations/Eligibility	 Prohibit insurance companies from carving out benefits or charging higher rates to people with pre-existing health conditions⁶ Insurers participating in pools would be required to prove that they spend less on marketing strategies and more on direct caregiving⁶ 	 Establish national accounting standards requiring insurers to spend at least 85% of premiums on patient care¹⁰ Direct U.S. Department of Justice to conduct an immediate and comprehensive review of health insurance market and make recommendations about how to ensure a competitive market¹⁰ Update the 2001 Patients' Bill of Rights calling for common-sense protections often available in managed care¹⁰ Make sure that patients are not penalized for reasonably but unknowingly using out of network doctors¹⁰ Require insurers to keep plans open to everyone (regardless of pre-existing conditions) and charge fair premiums¹⁰ 	 Proposed health plan would ensure that no American is denied access to health care because of illness or pre-existing conditions⁷ Eliminate excessive subsidies of Medicare Advantage program and pay some amount it would cost to treat patients under regular Medicare⁷ Increase general regulations on mergers between health insurers⁷
Malpractice/Professional Liability	Pass National Medical Error Disclosure and Compensation (MEDiC) Act: Encourages liability protections for physicians that disclose medical errors to patients and who offer to enter into negotiations for fair compensation ¹	 Require lawyers to have an expert testify that malpractice has occurred before bringing a suit¹⁰ Sanctions for lawyers who file frivolous cases¹⁰ Revisit insurance company exception to national antitrust laws¹⁰ Provide resources and incentives to state medical boards for more 	 Promote new models to address patient safety, strengthen the doctor-patient relationship, and reduce need for malpractice suits⁷ Require providers to report preventable medical errors and support hospital and physician practice improvement programs⁷ Strengthen antitrust laws to prevent insurers from

		 responsible discipline¹⁰ Create a knowledge bank that encourages doctors to report medical errors voluntarily¹⁰ 	overcharging physicians for malpractice insurance ⁷
Increasing Drug Availability and Reducing Their Costs	 Remove barriers to generic drug competition¹¹ Increase funding for Office of Generic Drugs at the FDA to eliminate backlog of generic drug applications¹¹ Give FDA authority to approve safe and effective biogeneric drugs¹¹ Allow Medicare to negotiate lower drug prices¹¹ Provide more oversight of drug advertising, marketing excesses and inappropriate financial relationships with providers¹¹ Reduce overpayments to private managed care plans¹¹ 	 Convene an expert panel to identify whether there are discoveries where prizes, not patent monopolies, would offer new incentives to researchers¹⁰ Drug companies are guaranteed a significant payment in exchange for allowing competition in manufacturing and distribution¹⁰ Give the FDA authority to approve safe and effective generic biologic alternatives which will create more choices and lower costs¹⁰ Ensure that electronic pedigrees accurately document the sales path of a drug to help combat counterfeiting and illegal drug wholesaling¹⁰ Require independent testing of drugs and make information about comparative effectiveness available to the FDA and to the public¹⁰ Require new restrictions on drug advertisements to ensure accurate information about side effects and efficacy¹⁰ Double FDA resources dedicated to enforcing direct-to-consumer advertisement rules¹⁰ Require independent comparative testing of drugs as a condition of FDA approval¹⁰ Institute rules against gift-giving from pharmaceutical companies to 	 Increase competition in drug market⁷ Allow Federal government to negotiate prices for medications directly with pharmaceutical companies under Medicare prescription drug benefit⁷ Allow U.S. residents to purchase medications from Canada and other industrialized nations if drugs are safe and prices are lower than in U.S.⁷ Increase use of generics in Federal and new public plans⁷ Prevent large drug companies from keeping generics out of market⁷

Eliminating Health Disparities	No information found	 physicians¹⁰ Require Pharmacy Benefit Managers (PBM) to disclose dealings with drug industry¹⁰ Support medical research on health disparities² Reduce pollutions and toxins that disproportionately harm communities of color² Support language translation services to address language barriers² 	 Address disparities in access to health coverage and promote prevention and public health⁷ Hospitals and health plans required to collect, analyze, and report health care quality for disparities⁷ Hold hospitals and health plans accountable for differences found⁷ Ensure diverse workforce to provide culturally effective care⁷ Implement and fund evidence- based interventions, such as patient navigator programs⁷ Support and expand capacity of safety-net institutions, which provide a disproportionate amount of care for underserved populations⁷
Public Health Preparedness Initiatives	No information found	 Establish single disease control office with authority to direct and coordinate government's response to disease outbreaks¹⁰ Establish real-time, unified national tracking system for diseases and vaccines that is easily accessible to public health officials¹⁰ Direct NIH to do research on more efficient vaccine production methods¹⁰ Establish national plan to increase reserves of needed vaccines⁹ Provide additional Federal support 	 Strengthen public health to protect against natural and man-made disasters⁷ Optimize organization of the existing 3000 health departments in the nation⁷ Foster collaboration between all levels of government and private sector partners⁷ Establish performance and accountability indicators, integrated and interoperable communication networks and disaster preparedness and response⁷

		À	to states to build their public health systems ¹⁰ Increase public health funding and improve coordination among health departments ¹⁰	A A	Modernize public health infrastructure including labs ⁷ Examine agricultural, educational, environmental and health policies to assess and improve their effects on public health ⁷
Mental Health	No information found	A	Acknowledges mental health care ¹²	No	information found

Please cite Susan J. Blumenthal, M.D., Jessica B. Rubin, Michelle E. Treseler, Jefferson Lin, and David Mattos. U.S. Presidential Candidates' Prescriptions for a Healthier Future: A Side-by-Side Comparison. Huffington Post July 8, 2007. <website> in any future use of this material.

¹ Michelle Andrews, "Candidates write their prescriptions," <u>US News and World Report</u> 11 June 2007: 32-33. ² "Universal Health Care Through Shared Responsibility." <u>John Edwards 08.</u> 15 March 2007 http://johnedwards.com/about/issues/health-care-overview.pdf

³ "Democratic Presidential Candidates Discuss Health Care Coverage Expansion Plans As Part of Debate." Kaiser Daily Health Policy Report 4 June 2007. <http://kaisernetwork.org/daily_reports/print_report.cfm?DR_ID=45323&dr_cat=3>

⁴ Kathleen Gray, "Edwards: Health cost cuts need to start with drug, insurance firms." Detroit Free Press 14 June 2007.

⁵ "Presidential Candidate Sen. Obama Proposes Plan to Cover Uninsured, Improve Premium Affordability." Kaiser Daily Health Policy Report 30 May 2007. <http://www.kaisernetwork.org/daily_reports/print_report.cfm?DR_ID=45226&dr_cat=3>

⁶ "HEALTH CARE: Hillary Remarks on Reducing the Cost of Health Care." <u>Hillary for President.</u> 25 June 2007 < http://www.hillaryclinton.com/news/speech/view/?id=1789>

 ⁷ "Barack Obama's Plan for a Healthy America." <u>Obama '08.</u> 26 June 2007. http://www.barackobama.com/pdf/HealthPlanFull.pdf
 ⁸ Karen Tumulty, "Obama Channels Hillary on Health Care." <u>TIME</u> 29 May 2007.

¹⁰ "Reforming Health Care to Make it Affordable, Accountable, and Universal." John Edwards 08. 26 June 2007. < http://johnedwards.com/news/headlines/20070614-healthcare-costs-quality.pdf>

¹¹ "Hillary Clinton Announces Agenda to Lower Health Care Costs and Improve Value for All Americans." <u>Hillary for President</u>. 24 May 2007.

¹² Toner, Robin. "2008 Candidates Vow to Overhaul Health Care" *The New York Times*. 6 July 2007.