

CHART #3: SIDE-BY-SIDE COMPARISON OF LEADING REPUBLICAN CANDIDATES' HEALTH PLANS

By Susan J. Blumenthal, M.D., Jessica B. Rubin, Michelle E. Treseler, Jefferson Lin, and David Mattos*






	<u>Rudy Giuliani</u> 	<u>Mike Huckabee</u> 	<u>John McCain</u> 	<u>Mitt Romney</u> 	<u>Tommy Thompson</u> 
Stated Goals for Coverage	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Proposes shifting millions of Americans from employer-based health insurance into the individual insurance marketplace¹ ➤ Emphasizes personal responsibility² ➤ Allow people to purchase health insurance from any state, regardless of their place of residence³ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Will work with private sector, Congress, health care providers and other parties to overhaul health system⁴ ➤ Wants Americans to have more control of their health care options⁵ ➤ Proposes shift from employer-based to consumer-based health care⁶ ➤ Proposes making health care more affordable and portable⁷ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Proposes making health care affordable and available without a mandated universal system⁸ ➤ Expand community health centers⁹ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Proposes affordable, portable insurance for all Americans, not through government programs or new taxes, but through market based approaches and reforms¹⁰ ➤ Individuals choose plans from private sector¹¹ ➤ Emphasizes personal responsibility¹² 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Build a health care system that is affordable and accessible for everyone.³¹ ➤ Establish a system that controls costs and that is centered on preventive medicine rather than curative.¹³ ➤ Strengthen Medicare and Medicaid programs ➤ Use public and private sectors to provide health care for all.³¹
Mandatory Insurance Requirements	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Opposes government mandate requiring all individuals to purchase coverage¹⁴ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Opposes universal health care mandated by federal edict¹⁵ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Does not require all Americans to buy health insurance¹⁶ 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Opposes Federal mandate for individuals to obtain health insurance¹⁷ 	No information found
Costs of Plan	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found
How costs are covered	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Give families a \$15,000 tax credit to purchase private 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Advocates policies that encourage private sector to seek 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Tax incentives and credits to encourage low-income 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Let states have some flexibility to develop their own programs 	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Use health IT to cut costs, reduce medical errors, and create a

CHART #3: SIDE-BY-SIDE COMPARISON OF LEADING REPUBLICAN CANDIDATES' HEALTH PLANS

	<p>insurance policies and allow them to keep whatever credit remains as an incentive to purchase cost-effective plans¹⁸</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Permit families to set up health savings accounts (HSAs) of \$2,000 to \$6,000 to cover medical expenses, before insurance kicks in¹⁹ 	<p>innovative ways to bring down costs and improve free market for health care services²⁰</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Proposes reforming medical liability, adopting electronic record keeping, making health insurance more portable, expanding health savings accounts to everyone, and making health insurance tax deductible for individuals and families²¹ ➤ Low income families get tax credits instead of deductions²² 	<p>individuals to buy insurance²³</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Increase availability of health savings accounts (HSAs)²⁴ 	<p>to get more people insured²⁵</p>	<p>more efficient health care system³¹</p>
Estimated savings	No information found	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Proposes to reduce health care costs from 17% to 11% of GDP²⁶ ➤ \$700 billion/year²⁷ 	No information found	No information found	No information found
Implementation Timeline	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found
Coverage for Children	No information found	No information found	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Expand SCHIP²⁸ 	No information found	No information found
Medicaid Expansion	No information found	No information found	No information found	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Would help people who can't afford it buy their own private insurance—would not enroll them in Medicaid²⁹ 	Strengthen Medicaid ³¹
New Federal/Public Plans	No information found	No information found	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Increase health care for veterans³⁰ 	No information found	No information found

CHART #3: SIDE-BY-SIDE COMPARISON OF LEADING REPUBLICAN CANDIDATES' HEALTH PLANS

Insurance Pools	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	➤ Require states to organize purchasing pools among the uninsured. Allow private insurers to bid on their coverage. This arrangement would provide health insurance for families while allowing purchasing pools to negotiate better prices for care ³¹
Employer Mandate	➤ Shifts millions away from employer-based insurance into individual insurance marketplace ³²	➤ Proposes shift from employer-based to consumer-based health care ³³	No information found	No information found	No information found
Disease Prevention	No information found	➤ Emphasizes prevention ³⁴	No information found	No information found	➤ Build a health system centered on preventive medicine, rather than curative medicine ³⁵ ➤ Prevention education programs ³⁶
Chronic Disease Management	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found
Long Term Care	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	➤ Make long-term care affordable ³⁷
Nursing Shortage	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found
Quality/Evidence-Based Health Care	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found
Transparency/Consumer Friendliness	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found
Information Technology (IT)	No information found	➤ Adopt electronic record keeping ³⁸	➤ Supports putting health care online ³⁹	No information found	➤ Use health information technology to cut costs, reduce medical errors and create a more efficient health

CHART #3: SIDE-BY-SIDE COMPARISON OF LEADING REPUBLICAN CANDIDATES' HEALTH PLANS

					care system ⁴⁰ ➤ Establish interoperable, electronic medical record IT system ⁴¹
Telemedicine	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found
Health Insurance Regulations/ Eligibility	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found
Malpractice/Professional Liability	No information found	➤ Reform medical liability ⁴²	➤ Proposes medical malpractice reform ⁴³	No information found	No information found
Increasing Drug Availability and Reducing Their Costs	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found
Eliminating Health Disparities	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found
Public Health Preparedness Initiatives	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found
Mental Health	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found	No information found

Please cite **Susan J. Blumenthal, M.D., Jessica B. Rubin, Michelle E. Treseler, Jefferson Lin, and David Mattos. *U.S. Presidential Candidates' Prescriptions for a Healthier Future: A Side-by-Side Comparison*. Huffington Post July 8, 2007.** <website> in any future use of this material.

¹ "Giuliani Health Proposal Seeks Individual Coverage." *The Wall Street Journal*. 7 June 2007. <<http://online.wsj.com/article/SB118117722127727221.html>>

² Ibid

³ "Republican Presidential Candidate Giuliani to Announce Health Insurance Proposal with Focus on Individual Coverage Market." *Medical News Today*. 10 June 2007. <<http://www.medicalnewstoday.com/medicalnews.php?newsid=73576>>.

⁴ "On the Issues: Health Care." *Mike Huckabee: The Exploratory Committee* 5 July 2007. <http://www.explorehuckabee.com/index.cfm?FuseAction=Issues.View&Issue_ID=8>.

⁵ Ibid.

⁶ Ibid.

⁷ Ibid.

⁸ "McCain to Prescribe Remedy for U.S. Health Care Ills." *Washington Wire - WSJ.com*. 10 June 2007. <<http://blogs.wsj.com/washwire/2007/06/10/mccain-to-prescribe-remedy-for-us-health-care-ills/>>.

CHART #3: SIDE-BY-SIDE COMPARISON OF LEADING REPUBLICAN CANDIDATES' HEALTH PLANS

- ⁹ Ibid.
- ¹⁰ "Extending Health Insurance to All Americans." Mitt Romney: True Strength for America's Future. 25 June 2007. Romney for President. <http://www.mittromney.com/Issue-Watch/Health_Care>.
- ¹¹ Ibid
- ¹² Ibid
- ¹³ Phelps, David. "Universal coverage called an economic imperative" Star Tribune, 15 June 2007. <<http://www.startribune.com/535/story/1249493.html>>
- ¹⁴ "Giuliani Health Proposal Seeks Individual Coverage." *The Wall Street Journal*. 7 June 2007. <<http://online.wsj.com/article/SB118117722127727221.html>>
- ¹⁵ "On the Issues: Health Care." *Mike Huckabee: The Exploratory Committee* 5 July 2007. <http://www.explorehuckabee.com/index.cfm?FuseAction=Issues.View&Issue_ID=8>.
- ¹⁶ "McCain to Prescribe Remedy for U.S. Health Care Ills." *Washington Wire - WSJ.com*. 10 June 2007. <<http://blogs.wsj.com/washwire/2007/06/10/mccain-to-prescribe-remedy-for-us-health-care-ills/>>.
- ¹⁷ Toner, Robin. "2008 Candidates Vow to Overhaul Healthcare" *The New York Times*. 6 July 2007. <<http://www.nytimes.com/2007/07/06/us/politics/06health.html?ref=health>>
- ¹⁸ "Presidential Candidate Giuliani's Health Care Proposal Includes Tax Incentives For People To Enroll In Private Health Plans." *Medical News Today*. 12 June 2007. <<http://www.medicalnewstoday.com/medicalnews.php?newsid=73641>>.
- ¹⁹ Gordon, Craig. "Giuliani to offer his health care plan." *Newsday.com*. 8 June 2007. <<http://www.newsday.com/news/politics/ny-usrudy085246818jun08,0,857766.story?coll=ny-nationworld-nation-utility>>.
- ²⁰ "On the Issues: Health Care." *Mike Huckabee: The Exploratory Committee* 5 July 2007. <http://www.explorehuckabee.com/index.cfm?FuseAction=Issues.View&Issue_ID=8>.
- ²¹ Ibid.
- ²² Ibid.
- ²³ "McCain to Prescribe Remedy for U.S. Health Care Ills." *Washington Wire - WSJ.com*. 10 June 2007. <<http://blogs.wsj.com/washwire/2007/06/10/mccain-to-prescribe-remedy-for-us-health-care-ills/>>.
- ²⁴ Ibid
- ²⁵ "Mitt Romney 'Goes On the Record'" *FOXNews.com*. 24 April 2007. <<http://www.foxnews.com/story/0,2933,268062,00.html>>
- ²⁶ "On the Issues: Health Care." *Mike Huckabee: The Exploratory Committee* 5 July 2007. <http://www.explorehuckabee.com/index.cfm?FuseAction=Issues.View&Issue_ID=8>.
- ²⁷ Ibid.
- ²⁸ "McCain to Prescribe Remedy for U.S. Health Care Ills." *Washington Wire - WSJ.com*. 10 June 2007. <<http://blogs.wsj.com/washwire/2007/06/10/mccain-to-prescribe-remedy-for-us-health-care-ills/>>.
- ²⁹ "Mitt Romney 'Goes On the Record'" *FOXNews.com*. 24 April 2007. <<http://www.foxnews.com/story/0,2933,268062,00.html>>
- ³⁰ "McCain to Prescribe Remedy for U.S. Health Care Ills." *Washington Wire - WSJ.com*. 10 June 2007. <<http://blogs.wsj.com/washwire/2007/06/10/mccain-to-prescribe-remedy-for-us-health-care-ills/>>.
- ³¹ "Healthcare: Common Sense Solutions." *Tommy Thompson for President*. 25 June 2007. <<http://www.tommy2008.com/Healthcare.aspx>>
- ³² "Giuliani Health Proposal Seeks Individual Coverage." *The Wall Street Journal*. 7 June 2007. <<http://online.wsj.com/article/SB118117722127727221.html>>
- ³³ "On the Issues: Health Care." *Mike Huckabee: The Exploratory Committee* 5 July 2007. <http://www.explorehuckabee.com/index.cfm?FuseAction=Issues.View&Issue_ID=8>.
- ³⁴ "On the Issues: Health Care." *Mike Huckabee: The Exploratory Committee* 5 July 2007. <http://www.explorehuckabee.com/index.cfm?FuseAction=Issues.View&Issue_ID=8>.
- ³⁵ "Healthcare: Common Sense Solutions." *Tommy Thompson for President*. 25 June 2007. <<http://www.tommy2008.com/Healthcare.aspx>>
- ³⁶ Ibid
- ³⁷ Ibid
- ³⁸ "On the Issues: Health Care." *Mike Huckabee: The Exploratory Committee* 5 July 2007. <http://www.explorehuckabee.com/index.cfm?FuseAction=Issues.View&Issue_ID=8>.

CHART #3: SIDE-BY-SIDE COMPARISON OF LEADING REPUBLICAN CANDIDATES' HEALTH PLANS

- ³⁹ "McCain to Prescribe Remedy for U.S. Health Care Ills." *Washington Wire - WSJ.com*. 10 June 2007. <<http://blogs.wsj.com/washwire/2007/06/10/mccain-to-prescribe-remedy-for-us-health-care-ills/>>.
- ⁴⁰ "Healthcare: Common Sense Solutions." *Tommy Thompson for President*. 25 June 2007. <<http://www.tommy2008.com/Healthcare.aspx>>
- ⁴¹ Ibid
- ⁴² "On the Issues: Health Care." *Mike Huckabee: The Exploratory Committee* 5 July 2007. <http://www.explorehuckabee.com/index.cfm?FuseAction=Issues.View&Issue_ID=8>.
- ⁴³ "McCain to Prescribe Remedy for U.S. Health Care Ills." *Washington Wire - WSJ.com*. 10 June 2007. <<http://blogs.wsj.com/washwire/2007/06/10/mccain-to-prescribe-remedy-for-us-health-care-ills/>>.